A New Agenda for Higher Education

Shaping a Life of the Mind for Practice

William M. Sullivan
Matthew S. Rosin

Foreword by Lee S. Shulman & Gary D. Fenstermacher
For more than a century, The Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching has been dedicated to promoting the profession of teaching and the improvement of teaching and learning in the nation’s colleges and schools. The Foundation has demonstrated that the role of educational leaders is to define the impact of education on students intellectually, practically and morally, and to develop new ideas and tools to foster positive change.

The Authors

WILLIAM M. SULLIVAN
Senior Scholar, Carnegie Foundation

MATTHEW S. ROSIN
Carnegie Consulting Scholar

The Contributors

LEE S. SHULMAN
President, Carnegie Foundation

GARY D. FENSTERMACHER
Professor of Education, University of Michigan


The Life of the Mind for Practice Seminar was part of a multi-year comparative study of professional education in the United States called the Preparation for the Professions Program (PPP) at The Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching, jointly supported by the Carnegie Corporation of New York.
HIGHLIGHTS FROM

A NEW AGENDA FOR HIGHER EDUCATION

SHAPING A LIFE OF THE MIND FOR PRACTICE

William M. Sullivan
Matthew S. Rosin

A PUBLICATION OF

THE CARNEGIE FOUNDATION for the ADVANCEMENT of TEACHING
Introduction

What is higher education for? As American higher education edges ever closer to becoming a universal requirement, this is a serious question.

Today’s students will be called upon to meet the practical and professional challenges that await them with insight, technical know-how and discerning moral commitment. Their success will be directly determined by how effectively they have learned to respond to the world in which they live and make informed and responsible judgments about the role they will play within it.

With the growing number of students attending institutions of higher education, a significant responsibility is placed on faculty in the professions and liberal arts. However, this conventional division of educational labor has come under increasing strain. The liberal arts find themselves encouraged to become more “practical” and “relevant,” while the professional schools are reproached for confining training to the technical aspects of their fields. To reconnect a fragmented academy, A New Agenda for Higher Education: Shaping a Life of the Mind for Practice offers a conception of educational purpose that unites professional competence with the intellectual dimensions of life.

The authors propose that the academy’s educational mission is formative, and offer a new model of undergraduate teaching focused on the interdependence of liberal education and professional training. At its most effective, liberal education provides students with orientation, the intellectual capacity to make sense of their environment and to locate themselves reflectively within the complex influences of their time and place. In such education, the arts and sciences function as sources of insight and methods of understanding that faculty make available to students through a set of characteristic ways of teaching and learning, ranging from the lecture to the seminar. The aim of such teaching is often described as developing students’ ability to assume responsibility for their purposes and identity.

Professional education, by contrast, must provide the knowledge essential to a particular field of endeavor, but it cannot remain entirely in the realm of observation and theory. To be effective, educators of professionals have to find ways to provide their students with access to the actual practices as well as the purposes of the profession. The teaching practices through which professional schools attempt these ambitious aims emphasize engagement and responsibility for clients. They do this in order to shape their students’ identities around the standards of competence and commitment that define responsibility for others.

A New Agenda for Higher Education sets out ways of integrating practices from professional education that engage students in practice and reflection, with teaching practices from the liberal arts which provide sources for the formation of competent and responsible persons. By reconnecting analytic insight with practical judgment and action, students learn how best to enter situations, how to sustain aims amid changing circumstances, and how to frame and reframe purposes while seeking with others a common good.
A Practical Book for Educators

A New Agenda for Higher Education is written for faculty, graduate students, those working in administrative leadership and support, and campus centers of teaching and learning who want to be more responsive to the practical challenges that await their students. It highlights the practices of teachers—leaders in their respective fields—who work to educate students for lives of significance and responsibility. The narratives in the publication offer a window into teachers’ reflective engagement with their own pedagogical possibilities and are made available for analysis and emulation.

This practical book also shares strategies to help educators discover a common, unifying mission that binds together the innovative practices and pedagogies already at work on their campuses, such as learning communities, service learning, community-based learning, and other forms of pedagogy that are concerned with the enrichment and renewal of conduct. Through a detailed description of a seminar process—from its planning, through to implementation and evaluation—the authors model a powerful process of faculty development and formation that encourages genuine cross-disciplinary and cross-professional collaboration. They also discuss how the seminar might be pursued by campuses and institutions in their own local settings.

More than just a theory of a better integrated undergraduate education, A New Agenda for Higher Education cultivates practices of engagement and dialogue that help faculty realize a richer understanding of the academic calling—offering the inspiration and tools needed to renew the teaching profession and the mission of higher education.

The Life of the Mind for Practice Seminar

A New Agenda for Higher Education is based upon The Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching Seminar “A Life of the Mind for Practice,” and is inspired by the Foundation’s Preparation for the Professions Program, which conducts research into the challenges that professional schools face to integrate technical expertise, practical know-how and normative purpose in professional education.

Begun in 2002, the interdisciplinary seminar gathered 14 partners from professions that feature a strong humanistic heritage, such as teacher education, law and the clergy; science-using professions such as medicine and engineering; and traditional liberal arts and science disciplines.

These educators, who represent public and private as well as secular and religious institutions—ranging from research universities to liberal arts colleges—were chosen for their individual dedication to reconnecting student analytic insight with practical judgment and action.

The seminar partners met three times to inquire into higher education’s ability to prepare students for lives of engagement and responsibility. Together these educators addressed a series of fundamental questions: What is the purpose of higher education? How should institutions respond pedagogically to the challenge of preparing students for today’s world? How might institutional divisions that prevent such responsiveness be overcome?

A New Agenda for Higher Education answers these questions, and shares the insights, missteps and successes learned from the Carnegie seminar. It also describes a set of collaborative practices—discovered through the seminar process—through which faculty learned to locate themselves within a common struggle—to develop
in students a “life of the mind,” and a “life of the mind for practice.” Through a narrative of the seminar, the book explains how these practices evolved, and how they helped the partners become invested in the professional development of one another, allowing them to discover common predicaments and purposes in their teaching. The authors also offer a common language, developed by the seminar partners, that bridges the liberal-professional divide.

A New Agenda for Higher Education provides the Carnegie seminar’s strategies needed to achieve best practices across the professions and disciplines so that students understand that critical insight achieves significance through participating in, and taking responsibility for, the problems of their community or profession.

**Key Observations**

The following sources of academic isolation sustain the current tension between the liberal arts and professional education in the academy.

- Faculty who value practical judgment as an end of their teaching find themselves isolated within their academic specialties without a broadly shared discourse for finding new peers or communicating the value of their work for the academy as a whole.

- “Critical thinking” means standing apart from the world and establishing reasons and causes. This is a necessary aspect of practical reasoning, but is not sufficient for responsible judgment. Education must also give students access to valued practices for engaging the world more mindfully.

Faculty formation directed toward teaching for responsible judgment must also overcome four challenges: developmental, institutional, dialogical and contextual. These four challenges are considerations that campus leaders must keep in mind in order to establish the new model of undergraduate teaching in their local context.

- To overcome the developmental challenge, faculty need to engage in collaborative dialogue, writing and reflection, inquiring deeply into what teaching for practical judgment means for their campus.

- To meet the institutional challenge, faculty, together with other academic leaders, should foster connections between individuals and fields. Faculty must have a place to ask hard questions about the relationship between their own teaching and its practical contexts, and to give legitimate voice to an academic calling that goes against the grain of typical academic aspirations.

- In order to address the dialogical challenge, faculty should serve as pedagogical exemplars to one another. Faculty must also have opportunities to enter imaginatively into each other’s perspectives, ideally across fields, in order to discover analogies that bind them in common purpose.

- Together with other academic leaders, faculty must be able to adapt the experience and composition of the seminar model in a productive way to their particular campus, its traditions, and its needs.
An Invitation to Colleges and Universities

*A New Agenda for Higher Education* calls for the renewal of academic purpose. It invites institutions to create the conditions needed to deepen and sustain faculty formation to better prepare students to participate in, and take responsibility for, their communities and professions. This requires the action and commitment of a broad network of academic actors, from administrative leadership and campus centers to graduate students and faculty. A goal of institutions should be to develop students who are more than critical thinkers; instead, they must become responsible agents able to take up a place in the life of their times. *A New Agenda for Higher Education* provides institutions with the foundation needed for developing individuals who can contribute to the future in ways that are both reflective and responsible.
Table of Contents

A NEW AGENDA FOR HIGHER EDUCATION
Shaping a Life of the Mind for Practice

Foreword
Preface
Introduction

Chapter One: Partners in the Field, Part One: Elliot N. Dorff, Arthur S. Elstein & Barbara S. Stengel

Chapter Two: Partners in the Field, Part Two: Gary Lee Downey, Daisy Hurst Floyd & William C. Spohn

Chapter Three: A Narrative of the Seminar

Chapter Four: Practical Reason as an Educational Agenda

Conclusion: Taking Formative Action

Appendix One: Partner Syllabi

Appendix Two: Seminar Assignments

Bibliography

The book will be available in April 2008 by Jossey-Bass.
www.jbp.com
The Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching

Board of Trustees

DAVID S. TATEL
Board Chair
U.S. Circuit Judge
U.S. Court of Appeals for D. C. Circuit

CATHARINE R. STIMPSON
Board Vice Chair
Dean of the Graduate School of Arts & Science
New York University

RICHARD C. ATKINSON
President Emeritus
University of California System

JÜRGEN BAUMERT
Director
Max Planck Institute for Human Development

YEHUDA ELKANA
President and Rector
Central European University

BERNADINE CHUCK FONG
President Emerita
Foothill College

SUSAN H. FUHRMAN
President
Teachers College, Columbia University

ELAINE TUTTLE HANSEN
President
Bates College

KATI HAYCOCK
Director
The Education Trust

JANET L. HOLMGREN
President and Susan Mills Professor
Mills College

FREEMAN A. HRABOWSKI III
President
University of Maryland, Baltimore County

JASON KAMRAS
2005 National Teacher of the Year

RICHARD A. MIDDLETON
Superintendent of Schools
San Antonio North East Independent School District

RENÉE A. MOORE
English Instructor
Mississippi Delta Community College

LYNN OLSON
Managing Editor
Education Week

EDUARDO J. PADRÓN
President
Miami Dade College
Miami, Florida

THOMAS PAYZANT
Professor of Practice
Harvard Graduate School of Education

ROB REICH
Associate Professor of Political Science & Ethics in Society, and Courtesy Professor in the School of Education
Stanford University

GORDON RUSSELL
Chair of the Carnegie Foundation Finance Committee
Member of the Executive Committee (ex officio)
General Partner (retired), Sequoia Capital

LEE S. SHULMAN
President
The Carnegie Foundation for the Advancement of Teaching

NINA ZOLT
Co-chair, Co-Founder, Chief Program Architect
ePALS, Inc.